



FH  
[REDACTED]

**STATE OF WISCONSIN  
Division of Hearings and Appeals**

---

In the Matter of:

[REDACTED]

DECISION

CTS/143556

---

**PRELIMINARY RECITALS**

Pursuant to a petition filed September 1, 2012, under Wis. Stat. § 227.42 (2009-10), to review a decision by the Columbia County Health and Human Services Department ["County"] in regard to the Caretaker Supplement Program ["CTS"], a Hearing was held via telephone on September 28, 2012. The Hearing in this matter was held at the same time as the Hearing for the following closely related matter concerning the same petitioner: FOO-143554.

The issue for determination is whether it was correct to discontinue petitioner's CTS benefit effective August 1, 2012.

There appeared at that time via telephone the following persons:

**PARTIES IN INTEREST:**

Petitioner:

[REDACTED]

Wisconsin Department of Health Services  
Room 651  
1 West Wilson Street  
P.O. Box 7850  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7850

Wendy Metcalf, ES Supervisor  
Carol Bride, ESS  
Becky Wegner, ESS

Columbia County Health and Human Services Department  
2652 Murphy Road  
P.O. Box 136  
Portage, Wisconsin 53901

OTHER PERSONS PRESENT:

Gregory Thiele, investigator, O'Brien & Associates  
 [REDACTED], petitioner's ex-wife

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE:

Sean P. Maloney  
 Division of Hearings and Appeals

**FINDINGS OF FACT**

1. Petitioner (CARES # [REDACTED]) is a resident of Portage County, Wisconsin.
2. Petitioner received notices dated August 15, 2012 and August 17, 2012 both entitled *About Your Benefits*; those notices informed petitioner that his CTS would end effective September 1, 2012 because both parents in the household did not get Supplemental Security Income ["SSI"] . Exhibit #8.
3. The County ended petitioner's CTS effective September 1, 2012 because it determined that petitioner's ex-wife lived with him and did not get SSI State SSI. Exhibit #6.
4. Petitioner's ex-wife lived with petitioner in July 2012 but moved out on July 29, 2012 and no longer lived with petitioner after July 29, 2012. Exhibits #1, #2 & #4.

**DISCUSSION**

A custodial parent is eligible for a CTS benefit only if, among other things, the custodial parent is a recipient of SSI or a recipient of State SSI (or both). Wis. Stat. § 49.775(2)(a) (2009-10); *SSI Caretaker Supplement (CTS) Handbook* ["CTS Handbook"], 3.1.4. If a dependent child has 2 custodial parents each custodial parent must get SSI or State SSI (or both). Wis. Stat. § 49.775(2)(b) (2009-10); CTS Handbook, 3.1.2. & 3.1.9. Eligibility for Social Security Disability Insurance ["SSDI"] does not qualify a parent as a CTS parent. CTS Handbook 3.14.

The County maintains that as of September 1, 2012 petitioner's ex -wife was part of petitioner's CTS household and that she does not get SSI or State SSI. This matter must be decided by a preponderance of the credible evidence. Wis. Admin. Code § HA 3.09(4) (2001).

Petitioner and his ex-wife testified credibly that they lived together in July 201 2 but that petitioner's ex -wife moved out on July 29, 2012 and no longer lived with petitioner after July 29, 2012. They testified that she went to live with her father. In addition, petitioner submitted a copy of a *Motion and Order to Dismiss Motion to Suspend Child Support* dated September 7, 2012 and an *Order* dated September 11, 2102 filed in Colombia County Circuit Court Case number 1111FA000139. That document concerns petitioner and his ex-wife and states, in part, that petitioner and his ex- wife "no longer reside together."

The only evidence the County presented to show that petitioner and his ex-wife lived together after July 29, 2012 was a 1-page investigative report from O'Brien & Associates dated August 2, 2102. Exhibit #6. The only relevant evidence contained in that report are statements made by petitioner's neighbors. First, it is not clear that the persons making those statements were aware that petitioner's ex -wife may have

moved-out on July 29, 2012 (the statements were made on August 2, 2012). Second, those statements are hearsay. See, Wis. Stat. § 908.01(3) (2009-10).

In circumstances such as these, when the reliability and probative force of hearsay evidence is suspect and that hearsay evidence is to form the sole basis for a finding of fact, the Wisconsin Supreme Court has held that uncorroborated hearsay does not constitute substantial evidence upon which to base a finding of fact. *Gehin v. Wisconsin Group Ins. Bd.*, 2005 WI 16, ¶¶ 53-56 & 58, 278 Wis. 2d 111, 692 N.W.2d 572; See also, *Williams v. Housing Auth. of City of Milwaukee*, 2010 WI App 14, ¶¶ 14 & 19, 323 Wis. 2d 179, 187 & 189, 779 N.W.2d 185 ["Uncorroborated hearsay evidence, even if admissible, does not by itself constitute substantial evidence."]. In these circumstances the Wisconsin Supreme Court has held that hearsay must be corroborated by nonhearsay evidence. *Gehin*, ¶¶ 82 & 92. There is no nonhearsay evidence in the record of this matter that corroborates the hearsay evidence offered by the County. Therefore, the County has failed to provide sufficient evidence to show that petitioner's ex -wife lived with petitioner on and after August 1 2012. It follows that the County's conclusion that petitioner and his ex -wife lived together on and after September 1, 2012 cannot be sustained and must be reversed. Therefore, it was not correct to discontinue petitioner's CTS benefit effective September 1, 2012.

### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

For the reasons explained above, it was not correct to discontinue petitioner's CTS benefit effective September 1, 2012.

**NOW, THEREFORE, it is**

### ORDERED

That this matter be REMANDED to the County, that the County not include petitioner's ex-wife in petitioner's CTS household effective September 1, 2012, and that, within 10 days of the date of this *Decision*, the County redetermine petitioner's eligibility for CTS retroactive to September 1, 2012 and issue all CTS for which petitioner is otherwise eligible retroactive to September 1, 2012.

### REQUEST FOR A REHEARING

This is a final administrative decision. If you think this decision is based on a serious mistake in the facts or the law, you may request a rehearing. You may also ask for a rehearing if you have found new evidence which would change the decision. Your request must explain what mistake the Administrative Law Judge made and why it is important or you must describe your new evidence and tell why you did not have it at your first hearing. If you do not explain these things, your request will have to be denied.

To ask for a rehearing, send a written request to the Division of Hearings and Appeals, P.O. Box 7875, Madison, WI 53707-7875. Send a copy of your request to the other people named in this decision as "PARTIES IN INTEREST." Your request for a rehearing must be received no later than 20 days after the date of the decision. Late requests cannot be granted.

The process for asking for a rehearing is in Wis. Stat. § 227.49. A copy of the statutes can be found at your local library or courthouse.

**APPEAL TO COURT**

You may also appeal this decision to Circuit Court in the county where you live. Appeals must be filed with the appropriate court no more than 30 days after the date of this hearing decision (or 30 days after a denial of rehearing, if you ask for one).

For purposes of appeal to circuit court, the Respondent in this matter is the Department of Health Services. After filing the appeal with the appropriate court, it must be served on the Secretary of that Department, either personally or by certified mail. The address of the Department is: 1 West Wilson Street, Room 651, Madison, Wisconsin 53703. A copy should also be sent to the Division of Hearings and Appeals, 5005 University Avenue, Suite 201, Madison, WI 53705-5400.

The appeal must also be served on the other "PARTIES IN INTEREST" named in this decision. The process for appeals to the Circuit Court is in Wis. Stat. §§ 227.52 and 227.53.

Given under my hand at the City of Madison,  
Wisconsin, this 10th day of October, 2012

---

Sean P. Maloney  
Administrative Law Judge  
Division of Hearings and Appeals



**State of Wisconsin \DIVISION OF HEARINGS AND APPEALS**

David H. Schwarz  
Suite 201  
5005 University Avenue  
Madison, WI 53705-5400

Telephone: (608) 266-3096  
FAX: (608) 264-9885  
email: [DHAmail@wisconsin.gov](mailto:DHAmail@wisconsin.gov)  
Internet: <http://dha.state.wi.us>

The preceding decision was sent to the following parties on October 10, 2012.

Columbia County Health & Human Services  
Division of Health Care Access and Accountability